Mr. A. Sankara Menon.—Rule 8 (g).

President.—That is a rule of admissibility. Every time the question comes these conditions are borne in mind. If you rely upon only (g), it is a question of admissibility.

Mr. A. Sankara Menon.—That relates to the question put in this House also.

President.—The questions are placed before the President. He looks into all these conditions whether any condition is violated with regard to that. He then admits the question. It goes to be answered. If the Government finds that the question has been improperly admitted, they submit the question again for re-consideration. In the Vrischigam Session the question was put and then the answer was given. The President ought to have seen that this was the same question which was once fully answered. It is the duty of the President to see if the question has been once answered and the question ought not to have been allowed. The President made a mistake here. He allowed the question to be put in the question paper book. The question has been answered.

Mr. A. Sankara Menon.—But he is referred back to the other answer.

President.—That is why I say it is a simplified form, instead of repeating all these answers.

Mr. C. J. Mathew.—We have nearly wasted 12 minutes on this point of order. I request that the time may be extended by 12 minutes.

President.—You have the right to put the supplementary questions, Mr. Salem.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know the year on which these records were destroyed?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I want notice. I do not remember all.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Is there any record kept with regard to the destruction of records in your office?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I think so, Sir.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—May I know, Sir, what is the difficulty in preparing? The answer is that it is so difficult and impractical to prepare the lists. There are only four years' lists.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I want to know definitely which is the sub-division.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—599 (a).

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—We have not reached that. It was not called.

599. Mr. A. B. Salem.—Will the Government be pleased to inform:—

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

(a) the names of the catalogues of medicines and instruments with which the prices of Messrs. Dada & Co., were compared by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer whereby he came to the conclusion that the prices charged by Messrs. Dada & Co., were comparatively cheaper and will the Government be pleased to place such catalogues on the Table of this House;

(b) will the Government be pleased to prepare and place on the Table a statement of the prices paid for medicines and instruments supplied by Messrs. Dada & Co., with the relative prices of well-known firms as Messrs. Burgoyne and Burbridges Co., Ltd., or any other European manufacturing firm or firms with which the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer compared the prices quoted or charged by Messrs. Dada & Co., for supplies in the years 1925, 1926, 1927 and 1928 up to the 1st of July 1928;

(c) will the Government be pleased to state if any local firm or firms (in Cochin or British Cochin) tendered to supply medicines manufactured by well-known and reliable firms according to the requirements of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer and the prices quoted by them;

(d) whether such prices when compared with prices charged by Messrs. Dada & Co., were favourable or unfavourable once to the Department;

(e) will the Government be pleased to state the value, the quantity and the nature of medicines got down by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer from firms or places other than Messrs. Dada & Co., and if so, the names of the firms and their address and their general catalogues be placed on the Table of the House;

(f) will the Government be pleased to state the total amount of money paid to Dada & Co., in 1925, 1926, 1927 and 1928?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—Vide answer to question No. 169 of the Lagislative Session of Vrischigam 1104.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—The answer to (b) of 169 to which I am referred,.....

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I want the supplementary question.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—What is the laborious work referred to?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—The question has only got to be read.

President.—599 (a): "The names of catalogues of medicines and instruments with which the prices of Messrs. Dada & Co., were compared by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer, whereby he came to the conclusion that the prices charged by

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Messrs. Dada & Co., were comparatively cheaper and will the Government be pleased to place such catalogues on the Table of the House."

What is the answer ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—That is a laborious task.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—To place the catalogues ? Is that the laborious task ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—All the catalogues available were placed.

President.—Catalogues were placed; but this comparison is a laborious task.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I ask, Sir, how the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer came to the conclusion that the prices of well-known firms were not cheaper. He says it is a laborious task to compare. Has he already compared and found? If he has compared, where he has compared, how he has compared and where is that paper ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I don't really grasp the question.

President.—A statement has been made in this House that the prices were compratively cheaper. So for a comparison must have been made. What is the laborious task in giving the result of the comparison which shows that it is cheaper ? How did you come to the conclusion ?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I have made a comparison when Messrs. Dada & Co's applications first came and rates were quoted. I then made a careful comparison with Ferris & Co.'s rates. But that is not what is wanted in the question. "Will the Government be pleased to prepare and place on the Table a statement of the prices paid for medicines and instruments supplied by Messrs. Dada & Co., with the relative prices of well-known firms as Messrs. Burgoyne and Burbridges & Co., Ltd., or any other European manufacturing firm or firms, for the supplies in the years 1925, 1926 and 1927?" Who is able to do all these things without having a special clerk to work at it? The Hon'ble Member applied to me to allow his own clerk to prepare this statement which I readily did. He tried to do for a few days and then retired.

President.—All that you compared was the figures given in that of Messrs. Dada & Co's catalogue with the figures in Messrs. Ferris & Co. You did not compare other catalogues. That is all. Comparison was made only with the prices in Messrs. Ferris & Co's catalogue.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I ask the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer whereby he came to the conclusion that the prices charged

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

were comparatively cheaper, and whether the Government will be pleased to place such catalogue on the Table of this House: Every year this has been going on. Naturally prices will vary from year to year everywhere in the market. This comparison must be going on and only then can this be found cheaper. Now we got the astounding statement of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer "I have only compared once". If that is so, I am prepared to take that answer. Where is the laborious task? If the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer cannot himself compare, a clerk may compare it.

President.—This answer was with reference to sub-division (b) which asks for a particular statement. If your answer was with reference to sub-division (a), he will have to make a fresh answer.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I asked in (b) to give a statement by which the Government came to the conclusion that it was cheaper.

President.—There was no comparison except with Messrs. Ferris & Co., Messrs. Dada & Co., and Ferris & Co., were compared with those of Messrs. Burgoyne and Burbridges or any other European manufacturing firm no comparison has been made. If you want to make use of the comparison, you must take the catalogue and you must go into the matter—a laborious process which will serve no purpose.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—It is only in the first year. And in the other years to which the question relates?

President.—I don't think you had occasion to compare details with any other firm than Messrs. Ferris & Co.?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—In the first year, it was with Messrs. Ferris & Co. I was always looking to the fluctuations in prices. I will write to them to change their prices according to the market?

President.—That is what you did. Whether you had occasion to compare the prices given by Messrs. Dada & Co., with those given by other firms than Messrs. Ferris & Co., in subsequent years.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I had.

President.—Which were those firms with reference to which you made comparison? What was the result? If you had really made any comparison, why should there be any difficulty in placing the result of such comparison before the House?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—I was not asked the result of the comparison; but to prepare a list of those years. If it was the result of the comparison, I have stated that in the first year I compared with Messrs. Ferris & Co's. prices only and in subsequent years with well-known English firms also well-known Indian firms, and I have watched fluctuations in prices

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

and tried to obtain terms whenever possible and found Dada's terms more favourable. So you will see that the second year's price is cheaper than the first. All these were placed on the Table. In the third year prices were still cheaper. All were placed on the Table last time—as many catalogues as were available with which comparisons were made.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—I did not ask about catalogues. I only asked about the comparative statement of medicines.

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—All those statements are lost.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—Now the Member in charge says that he compared with other catalogues. There must be a statement in the office for comparison.

President.—Is there any such statement kept in the office?

Diwan Bahadur Dr. V. Verghese.—When I made comparison, I must have made statement sufficient to convince me that I could not get cheaper rates, but these notes have not been preserved.

Mr. A B. Salem.—What is the difficulty in making the statements?

Diwan Bahadur Dr V. Verghese.—It takes time and labour now to prepare them.

Mr. A. B. Salem.—There is the invoice for that and there is the price list. It is only when it is compared that the result will be found in some places. What is the laborious work, I don't see.

President.—We are passing into other regions, into the regions of specialists.

60. Mr. A. B. Salem.—Will the Government be pleased to state:—

(1) whether before the last Budget Session Mr. S. Koder had sent in a tender for the supply of medicines to the Medical Department; and if so, whether the same was scrutinised by the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer to see how it compared with the prices that were charged by Messrs. Dada & Co.;

(2) will the Government be pleased to state by name or by office the person in the Medical Department who has been checking the prices of medicines charged by Messrs. Dada & Co., during the last three years in the Office of the Chief Medical and Sanitary Officer;

(3) whether the relative English and Continental price lists were made available to that officer for comparing the prices charged by Dada & Co, with the European prices;

(4) will the Government be pleased to state whether Messrs. Ferris & Co., Ltd., who have been supplying medicines and instruments to the Cochin State were not informed by the

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly